



House of Commons  
CANADA

## Standing Committee on National Defence

---

NDDN • NUMBER 014 • 2nd SESSION • 39th PARLIAMENT

---

EVIDENCE

**Thursday, February 28, 2008**

—  
**Chair**

**Mr. Rick Casson**

Also available on the Parliament of Canada Web Site at the following address:

**<http://www.parl.gc.ca>**

## Standing Committee on National Defence

Thursday, February 28, 2008

• (1650)

[English]

**The Chair (Mr. Rick Casson (Lethbridge, CPC)):** Order, please.

The clerk has the wording of the motion that Mr. Hawn is proposing. I'd like him to read it for us.

**Ms. Dawn Black (New Westminster—Coquitlam, NDP):** Mr. Chairman, wouldn't my motion be first? It's waiting on the books.

**The Chair:** Does it matter what—

**Ms. Dawn Black:** It does to me, yes. It's been hanging around for a few weeks now.

**The Chair:** Okay, Ms. Black, we will do that.

**Ms. Dawn Black:** Thank you.

**The Chair:** The floor is yours, Ms. Black.

**Ms. Dawn Black:** Claude has an amendment.

**The Chair:** Mr. Bachand.

[Translation]

**Mr. Claude Bachand (Saint-Jean, BQ):** I do not want to quibble, Mr. Chair, but my amendment updates the motion so that it makes sense. Ms. Black's motion says that the witnesses are going to appear today, February 28. That is impossible. It makes more sense if we put “as soon as possible” instead of “at the regularly scheduled meeting to be held on February 28, 2008”.

[English]

**The Chair:** Just for clarification, the amendment by Mr. Bachand to the motion by Ms. Black is to strike the words “to be held on February 28th, 2008” and replace them with “as soon as possible”.

(Amendment agreed to)

**The Chair:** The amended motion is that as part of the committee's study of health services provided to Canadian Forces personnel with an emphasis on post-traumatic stress disorder, the committee invite Ms. Cindy Smith-MacDonald and Ann le Clair to appear before the Standing Committee on National Defence at a regularly scheduled meeting as soon as possible.

Is there any discussion?

All those in favour? Four in favour, four opposed.... Oh, don't do this. Are the rest of you going to vote or is that it? Are you abstaining?

**Some hon. members:** Oh, oh!

**The Chair:** Let's do that one more time, please. All those in favour, please signify....

**Hon. Denis Coderre (Bourassa, Lib.):** I have a question first, Mr. Chair. Just for clarification, does that mean your two names will be the two of the other motion?

**Ms. Dawn Black:** Yes.

**Hon. Denis Coderre:** Okay.

**The Chair:** All those in favour? And this is the last time I'm asking.

(Motion as amended agreed to: yeas 6; nays 4)

**The Chair:** Samy, would you read the other motion.

**The Clerk of the Committee (Mr. Samy Agha):** The motion is that during two in camera meetings, the committee receive testimony from individual soldiers and families regarding its study of Canadian Forces health services, with an emphasis on PTSD, and that committee members propose a maximum of 16 names—eight individual soldiers and eight family members—to the clerk.

• (1655)

**Ms. Dawn Black:** I don't think we'll get that many folks here.

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** Could we have that in French now, please?

**The Chair:** Was it not interpreted?

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** It was, but the written form is in English. Can we have it in French?

**The Clerk:** Sure. I can translate it off the top of my head, if that's okay; I hope I don't make any mistakes.

**The Chair:** That might not be his point.

[Translation]

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** The motion mentions soldiers, but veterans suffer from post-traumatic stress disorder too. Are they eligible to come to the committee?

[English]

**Mrs. Cheryl Gallant (Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke, CPC):** Veterans Affairs.

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** So it's soldiers only. Is that it?

**Mrs. Cheryl Gallant:** Yes.

[Translation]

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** That is not what they say.

[English]

**The Chair:** I think a soldier is a soldier.

The clerk will read the motion.

[*Translation*]

**The Clerk:** It reads as follows:

Que, lors de deux (2) séances à huis clos, le Comité entend les témoignages de soldats à titre individuel et des membres de leurs familles dans le cadre de son étude sur les Services de santé offerts au personnel des Forces canadiennes, en particulier dans le cas des troubles de stress post-traumatique; et que les membres du Comité présentent les noms d'au plus seize (16) soldats à titre individuel et des membres de leurs familles au greffier.

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** I would like a motion of congratulations to the clerk, Mr. Chair.

[*English*]

**The Chair:** Mr. Coderre.

[*Translation*]

**Hon. Denis Coderre:** I have a question on the motion. If I understand it correctly, the two people in the previous motion are part of this list. Is that correct?

[*English*]

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** That's a problem. Who decides on the 16 persons? Are there four from each party?

**The Chair:** We wanted to leave it without—

**Mr. Claude Bachand:** Without party selection—so do we provide names to the clerk? Okay.

**Hon. Denis Coderre:** So the two individuals we vote for are from that list. Is that right?

Thank you.

**Mr. Laurie Hawn (Edmonton Centre, CPC):** And we'll collectively guarantee that they'll be on the list.

**Ms. Dawn Black:** That's what you voted for.

(Motion agreed to)

**Mr. Laurie Hawn:** I have a point of order, Mr. Chair.

I'm not sure if it's a point of order or clarification, but I want to make it very clear on the record that we on this side voted against Ms. Black's motion with the understanding that those two people covered by her motion would be covered by the following motion we proposed, which was passed unanimously. It was not an effort to exclude those women from—

**Hon. Denis Coderre:** It was part of a two solitudes issue, but we settled it.

**Mr. Laurie Hawn:** Did you understand that, Dawn?

**Ms. Dawn Black:** No, I didn't understand it at all.

**Mr. Laurie Hawn:** Let me make it clear, because if it comes up in the House I will have something to say.

We voted against your motion with the understanding that by passing the second motion those two women would be included in that process. It was not in any way to exclude those two women from the process of coming before the committee. Is that clear?

**Ms. Dawn Black:** Are you trying to intimidate or threaten me? It sure as hell sounds like it.

**Mr. Laurie Hawn:** No. I'm just asking you if that's clear.

**Ms. Dawn Black:** I already said that's my understanding, and now I have to account to you?

**Mr. Laurie Hawn:** I just want to make sure that is clear.

**The Chair:** Laurie, if you're both talking at once, neither one of you is going to get on the record. Do you understand it's impossible for that to happen?

I think we fully understand both sides of the story here, and if it comes up in the House you will both have to defend what you're doing. But two people talking at one time does not help the interpreters, it does not get on the record, and it causes trouble at the committee. So please bear with me here.

A couple of names have been provided by individuals already—Ms. Gallant, I think you're one—so go back over your lists and make sure that's exactly what you want to do.

Thank you.

Now we have a complete list of witnesses before the committee who have been suggested by our researchers. It's very lengthy and we have the next four meetings already set up. We've already heard from some of them, and they're highlighted. But is there any comment on that? Does anybody want to talk about it now, or have you had enough for one day?

● (1700)

**Mr. Laurie Hawn:** Mr. Chair, if we're going to discuss this, shouldn't it be in camera?

**The Chair:** Yes, I suppose it should. I apologize.

**Hon. Denis Coderre:** Can we talk at the same time? I'd like to see who...[*Inaudible*].

**The Chair:** No, you don't.

Before we go back in camera—

**Mrs. Cheryl Gallant:** I have a point of order. Before we go in camera, Mr. Chairman, I'd point out that I thought we had agreed we were going to keep the identities of the soldiers confidential. In reading that motion, I do not think that what we agreed upon was respected.

**Ms. Dawn Black:** It was already on the record, Cheryl, at the last meeting.

**The Chair:** There was a notice of motion.

Does the committee want to go back into committee of the whole, or have you had enough for one day, and we can do this another time?

**Hon. Denis Coderre:** I just want to know what the timeframe is to provide those names. Do you want that for the next meeting?

**The Chair:** We're going to have to go back into the committee of the whole, so we'll just suspend for a few minutes and go back in camera.

I keep saying that. I apologize. That's coming back from my old days.

[*Proceedings continue in camera*]







**Published under the authority of the Speaker of the House of Commons**

**Publié en conformité de l'autorité du Président de la Chambre des communes**

**Also available on the Parliament of Canada Web Site at the following address:  
Aussi disponible sur le site Web du Parlement du Canada à l'adresse suivante :  
<http://www.parl.gc.ca>**

---

**The Speaker of the House hereby grants permission to reproduce this document, in whole or in part, for use in schools and for other purposes such as private study, research, criticism, review or newspaper summary. Any commercial or other use or reproduction of this publication requires the express prior written authorization of the Speaker of the House of Commons.**

**Le Président de la Chambre des communes accorde, par la présente, l'autorisation de reproduire la totalité ou une partie de ce document à des fins éducatives et à des fins d'étude privée, de recherche, de critique, de compte rendu ou en vue d'en préparer un résumé de journal. Toute reproduction de ce document à des fins commerciales ou autres nécessite l'obtention au préalable d'une autorisation écrite du Président.**